

350 Fifth Avenue, 34th Floor
New York, NY 10118-3299
Tel: 212-290-4700
Fax: 212-736-1300; 917-591-3452

January 9, 2019

US PROGRAM

Nicole Austin-Hillery, *Executive Director*
Sara Darehshori, *Senior Counsel*
Dreisen Heath, *Senior Coordinator*
Elizabeth Kennedy, *Researcher*
Rachel Kent, *Press Officer*
Clara Long, *Senior Researcher*
Megan McLemore, *Senior Researcher*
Grace Meng, *Senior Researcher*
Alison Leal Parker, *Managing Director*
Laura Pitter, *Senior National Security Counsel*
Thomas Rachko, *Associate*
John Raphling, *Senior Researcher*
Brian Root, *Quantitative Analyst*
Sarah St. Vincent, *Researcher*
Jasmine L. Tyler, *Advocacy Director*

HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

Kenneth Roth, *Executive Director*
Michele Alexander, *Deputy Executive Director, Development and Global Initiatives*
Iain Levine, *Deputy Executive Director, Program*
Chuck Lustig, *Deputy Executive Director, Operations*
Bruno Stagno Ugarte, *Deputy Executive Director, Advocacy*

Emma Daly, *Communications Director*
Peggy Hicks, *Global Advocacy Director*
Babatunde Olujobi, *Deputy Program Director*
Dinah Pokempner, *General Counsel*
Tom Porteous, *Deputy Program Director*
James Ross, *Legal & Policy Director*
Joe Saunders, *Deputy Program Director*
Frances Sinha, *Human Resources Director*

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Hassan Elmasry, *Co-Chair*
Joel Motley, *Co-Chair*
Wendy Keys, *Vice-Chair*
Susan Maniow, *Vice-Chair*
Jean-Louis Servan-Schreiber, *Vice-Chair*
Sid Sheinberg, *Vice-Chair*
John J. Studzinski, *Vice-Chair*
Michael G. Fisch, *Treasurer*
Bruce Rabb, *Secretary*
Karen Ackman
Jorge Castañeda
Tony Elliott
Michael E. Gellert
Hina Jilani
Betsy Karel
Robert Kissane
David Lakhdir
Kimberly Marteau Emerson
Oki Matsumoto
Barry Meyer
Joan R. Platt
Amy Rao
Neil Rimer
Victoria Riskin
Graham Robeson
Shelley Rubin
Kevin P. Ryan
Ambassador Robin Sanders
Javier Solana
Siri Stolt-Nielsen
Darian W. Swig
Makoto Takano
John R. Taylor
Amy Towers
Peter Visser
Marie Warburg
Catherine Zennström

David Blumberg
Senior Director of Public Relations
TransUnion
555 West Adams Street
Chicago, IL 60661

Dear Mr. Blumberg:

Human Rights Watch is an independent international organization that monitors human rights in more than 90 countries and advocates for redress for abuses, including in the United States. We write to request TransUnion's input and perspectives regarding research we are conducting.

We have become aware of several concerns about a software suite offered by Child Rescue Coalition (CRC), a Florida-based nonprofit organization. This entity was established following the bankruptcy of TLO, LLC, and TransUnion's purchase of that company in 2013. The address listed on CRC's annual tax filings suggest that the organization is housed at the same location as TLO, LLC's successor, TLOxp. At time of writing, CRC also lists TransUnion among its supporters on its website, <https://childrescuecoalition.org>.

Court records and other information we have obtained suggest that CRC or the software suite it offers, Child Protection System (CPS), may facilitate law enforcement officers' access to "Unconfirmed Subscriber Data" provided by TLOxp that includes information linking identifiable individuals to Internet Protocol (IP) addresses. However, we have been unable to locate important details concerning the nature and origin of this "Unconfirmed Subscriber Data," or how CRC or TLOxp store and treat information generated as a result of law enforcement use of CPS. We have human-rights-based concerns about these and other aspects of CPS.

CRC's mission focus on ending abuse of children is a goal that we, as an international human rights organization, share. However, to address our concerns and gain a better understanding of arrangements related to CPS, we would appreciate any comments you may be able to offer in response to the questions below. Where appropriate, please interpret references to TLOxp as references to its predecessor (TLO, LLC).

1. Could you clarify the nature of the corporate relationship between TLOxp and TransUnion? For example, is TLOxp a TransUnion subsidiary?
2. Could you clarify the nature of the relationship between TLOxp and CRC, both legally and in practice? For example, does TLOxp offer funding, in-kind support such as office space or server hosting, or data access to CRC?

HUMAN
RIGHTS
WATCH

HRW.org

3. Since 2013, has TransUnion provided funding or other support to Child Rescue Coalition?
4. Do law enforcement officers using CPS have the ability to view information from TLOxp linking individuals to IP addresses? Do they have the ability to view other information from TLOxp?
5. If TLOxp offers data linking individuals to IP addresses, including to officers investigating leads from CRC or the CPS software suite, what information does it use to establish this link? Is the data purchased or otherwise obtained from other entities, and if so, which ones?
6. Court testimony by William Wiltse (now CRC's president) in 2013 indicates that TLO had a restricted area on its property where CPS-enabled investigations took place and which only law enforcement officers were permitted to enter, to the exclusion even of TLO's CEO.¹ Does such a restricted area continue to exist today? If so, does TransUnion have access to it? What types of data are stored there, and how is the information secured?
7. In TransUnion's view, does the Fair Credit Reporting Act apply to any data TLOxp shares with CRC? Why or why not?
8. Does CRC share any data about individuals or IP addresses with TLOxp or TransUnion? If so, what types of data are shared, and how do TLOxp or TransUnion use them?
9. Court documents indicate that CRC retained access to TLO, LLC's proprietary BOLT algorithm following TLO's bankruptcy and the purchase of the company by TransUnion. Is this correct? If so, could you explain the nature of the BOLT algorithm and (to the best of your understanding) how CRC uses it?

Thank you for your attention to this request for comment. In order that we may incorporate your responses and perspectives, we would appreciate receiving them on or before January 24, 2019.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at [email removed].

Sincerely,

[signature]

Sarah St.Vincent
Researcher/Advocate on National Security, Surveillance, and Domestic Law Enforcement
Human Rights Watch

¹ *United States v. Thomas*, no. 5:12-cr-00037 (D. Vt.), Transcript: Motion to Suppress & Request for a *Franks* Hearing (doc. 99), April 17, 2013, pp. 131-32.