



COMPARATIVE TABLE

showing positions of Emmanuel Macron and Marine Le Pen on issues related to human rights

Human Rights Watch asked all presidential candidates about 11 topics relating to human rights in France and in the world. This table sets out the Human Rights Watch position on each of those topics alongside those of the two candidates in the second-round run-off: Marine Le Pen and Emmanuel Macron. Le Pen did not respond to the Human Rights Watch questions, so this table is based on her statements and official program. For Macron’s positions, this table also includes the answers he sent Human Rights Watch.

1. Human rights in France

Identity checks and ethnic profiling		
Human Rights Watch Position	Emmanuel Macron	Marine Le Pen
<p>To fight ethnic profiling, Human Rights Watch recommends police officers in France be required to issue a receipt every time they carry out an identity check to explain its legal basis and establish a written record.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ “We are not in favor of receipts.” (Letter) ▪ “The practice of identity checks sometimes contains discriminatory elements.” (Letter) ▪ “Training in police schools should be improved in this regard.” (Letter) ▪ “Generalize the use of body cameras to record identity checks.” (Program) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ To the best of our knowledge, Marine le Pen has not addressed the question of ethnic profiling by the police or how identity checks are conducted.

State of emergency and counterterrorism		
Human Rights Watch position	Emmanuel Macron	Marine Le Pen
<p>The indefinite extension of the state of emergency is a danger to the rule of law and the protection of fundamental freedoms. Human rights should be fully respected in all security and counterterrorism measures.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> “No candidate has the necessary information to know if the level of risk (...) allows for lifting the state of emergency.” (Letter) “[Only after my election] could I decide whether or not to lift the state of emergency.” (Letter) “[Lifting the state of emergency] is an objective for which we must aim, because a state of exception cannot become the norm.” (Letter) “[Revoking nationality for dual nationals] is dangerous and unrealistic.” (Program) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Criticized a “sham state of emergency.” Has not expressed a position on when the state of emergency should end. (Le Figaro, April 4th, 2017) “Ban organizations with links to Islamist groups.” (Program) “Revocation of nationality (...) for any dual national with links to a jihadist organization. Deport all foreigners with links to Islamist fundamentalism.” (Program) “Place in preventive detention French nationals with links to any foreign organization provoking hostile acts against France.” (Program)

Asylum		
Human Rights Watch position	Emmanuel Macron	Marine Le Pen
<p>France should uphold its international obligations to protect refugees fleeing violence and persecution and should show greater leadership within the European Union in that respect. The human rights of all asylum seekers on French territory should be protected. Strengthening the protection of unaccompanied migrant children, who are particularly vulnerable, should be a priority.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Europe has a duty to provide asylum to those who are persecuted and ask for its protection.” (Program) “[Asylum requests] should be taken care of in six months maximum, including appeals.” (Letter) “Study the possibilities of strengthening the protection of these unaccompanied children.” (Letter) “Improve information for these youths.” (Letter) “equitable sharing between European countries.” (Program) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> “All migrant camps will be dismantled.” (Communiqué) “Undocumented persons (...) will be sent to the border.” (Communiqué) “We will drastically reduce asylum.” (Communiqué) “Asylum requests will not be studied in France but in French embassies and consulates.” (Communiqué) “Make it impossible for undocumented immigrants to obtain papers or citizenship.” (Program) “No more schooling for undocumented [children].” (Huffington Post, December 8th, 2016) “Eliminate the State Medical Aid for undocumented people.” (Program)

2. International human rights issues

European Union		
Human Rights Watch position	Emmanuel Macron	Marine Le Pen
<p>The European Union should live up to its founding values of respect for human rights, in a context of skepticism toward European institutions and the rise of extreme nationalism. Human rights should be a priority of European diplomacy and internal policy, in particular regarding migration policy.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ “We note a progression of intolerant and racist language in Europe and the United States.” (Letter) ▪ “Europe must speak in a single voice on human rights.” (Letter) ▪ “The difficulties of Europe [include] the rise of nationalism, calling into question the Schengen area.” (Program) ▪ “Europe is (...) a project of peace, prosperity and liberty.” (Libération, March 23rd, 2017) ▪ “The refusal of several Central European countries to receive migrants is unacceptable. There must be sanctions. Countries that do not respect our principles should not have access to European funds.” (Libération, March 23rd, 2017) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ “A negotiation will be opened with our European partners followed by a referendum on our membership in the European Union.” (Program) ▪ “Reestablish national borders and leave the Schengen area.” (Program)

United States		
Human Rights Watch position	Emmanuel Macron	Marine Le Pen
<p>France’s bilateral and multilateral relations with the United States should always make the respect for human rights, fundamental freedoms and the rule of law a priority.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ “Several declarations by President [Trump] raise doubts about the new administration’s intentions concerning respect for human rights.” (Letter) ▪ “The United States leaving the UNHRC would be a worrying sign.” (Letter) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ “With Trump, with Theresa May, with Putin, with the Visegrad group, I do not feel isolated at all!” (Marine le Pen’s twitter account, November 20th, 2016) ▪ “Donald Trump’s election opens a new era of

<p>President Trump has taken steps that cause concerns for the protection of human rights in the United States and globally.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regarding a proposal by Lafarge, a large French multinational construction firm, to sell cement for the US-Mexico border wall: "Our businesses have a social and environmental responsibility and they participate in the world order." (La Voix du Nord, March 10th, 2017) 	<p>cooperation between nations." (Marine le Pen's twitter account, January 19th, 2016)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Most of the reactions [to the US travel ban] have been in bad faith." (CNN interview, February 1st, 2017)
---	--	---

<h2 style="text-align: center;">Syria</h2>		
<h3 style="text-align: center;">Human Rights Watch position</h3>	<h3 style="text-align: center;">Emmanuel Macron</h3>	<h3 style="text-align: center;">Marine Le Pen</h3>
<p>It is essential for any peace plan to include guarantees to respect human rights and protect civilians as well as accountability for war crimes and crimes against humanity carried out in Syria.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Considering the dismissal of Bashar Al-Assad as a prerequisite to everything was a mistake. Our main problem is ISIS." (Speech in Lebanon, January 24th, 2017) "Bashar al-Assad is a dictator. He has committed crimes, denounced by the United Nations. There won't be any peace without justice. Thus, I am not in favor of (...) a position of accommodation with Assad." (L'Orient, January 26th, 2017) "Crimes must be prosecuted." "History teaches us [...] that impunity shall not be accepted." (Letter) "The settlement of the Syrian conflict requires a demanding and realistic discussion with all the powers involved in this situation." (Letter) In favor of "an international military intervention under UN supervision" [if it is proven that the Syrian regime is responsible for the chemical attack in Khan Sheikhou]. (l'Emission politique, April 6) On the American airstrike : "It is always preferable to have coordination between allies on this matter." (Le Parisien, April 12th, 2017) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Bashar al-Assad is the viable solution [...] and a much more reassuring solution for France than ISIS." (Speech in Lebanon, February 20th, 2017) "Who else, other than Bashar al-Assad" can offer the best defense against ISIS. "This doesn't mean that I don't consider the chemical attack as a horror. Let's wait for the results of the international investigation before pursuing[OK?] justice ourselves." (RLT-LCI, April 9th, 2017) On the American airstrike: "I note that [Trump] makes [...] a choice [...] inconsistent with what he promised." (RTL, April 9th, 2017)

Russia		
	Emmanuel Macron	Marine Le Pen
<p>Human Rights Watch position</p> <p>In its relations with Russia, and with others about Russia, France should take into account the numerous violations of human rights and international law committed by the Russian authorities, as well as its position at the UN Security Council with regard to Syria.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ “It is necessary to talk with Russia to ensure the stability of the Middle East. But let us not forget who they are, what they do, and the nature of their regime.” (Libération, March 23rd, 2017) ▪ “Russia has revived its aggressive foreign policy, in Ukraine for instance, and threatens Eastern Europe, while tensions in Southeast Asia cause concern.” (Program) ▪ “We also intend to promote [...] the limitation of the use of the right of veto by the five permanent members of the UN Security Council when mass crimes occur.” (Letter) ▪ “This question divides Europe. It is first with our closest neighbors that we need to discuss and clarify an approach that gives human rights all their place in our relation with Moscow.” (Letter) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ [The Russian intervention in Syria] “has seriously undermined fundamentalism.” (Meeting with Putin, March 24th, 2017) ▪ “We do not believe in a diplomacy of threats, sanctions or blackmail.” (Meeting with Putin, March 24th, 2017) ▪ [Crimea] “has always been Russian [...] the sanctions against the Kremlin are completely stupid.” (CNN, February 1st, 2017) ▪ “I went [to Russia] to discuss the necessity for great nations to cooperate [...] in the fight against terrorism.” (Europe 1, March 27th, 2017)

Saudi Arabia		
	Emmanuel Macron	Marine Le Pen
<p>Human Rights Watch position</p> <p>As long as the bombings targeting civilians have not ceased and are not investigated in an independent and credible manner, it is essential that any arms sales to Saudi Arabia and to the countries of the Saudi-led coalition in Yemen stop.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ “We do not want to sell weapons that could then be used to kill civilians. This is unbearable. If we work with the Gulf monarchies, we will condition our contracts to the respect of human rights and ensure that French weapons are exclusively used for the defense of our partners.” (Letter) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ To the best of our knowledge, Marine Le Pen has not expressed a public position on arms sales to Saudi Arabia and the Saudi-led coalition.

China		
<p>Human Rights Watch position</p> <p>France, which has close diplomatic and economic relations with China, should call for the immediate release of Liu Xiao Bo, Nobel Peace Laureate in 2010, and call for an end to arbitrary detention in China.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<p>Emmanuel Macron</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “We won’t put aside any topic when in discussions [OK?] with China. Those you mention are important. They will have to be addressed effectively.” (Letter) “China is a fundamental actor with which France and Europe must strengthen and balance their relations on security, trade and ecology. As such, we will open with our European partners a comprehensive initiative to negotiate a cross-border agreement with China.” (Program) 	<p>Marine Le Pen</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To the best of our knowledge, Marine Le Pen has not expressed a public position on discussing human rights with the Chinese authorities.

Military intervention in Africa		
<p>Human Rights Watch position</p> <p>France should ensure that military intervention abroad, in particular in the context of counterterrorism cooperation in countries of the Sahel region, does not contribute to violations by the armed forces backed by France, or by French forces themselves.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<p>Emmanuel Macron</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “France [will continue] judging its soldiers accused of having committed violations and let[ting] justice do its work with full independence.” (Letter) “We encourage the UN to invest more in [...] [its] service of ethics and discipline that ensures the Blue Helmets respect all the norms of conduct of the UN.” (Letter) In the Sahel, [...] [we must reinforce] training of local armed and security forces that always has a significant component on the respect of human rights [...] whenever possible.” (Letter) 	<p>Marine Le Pen</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To the best of our knowledge, Le Pen has not expressed a public position on how to ensure that military intervention abroad does not contribute to violations by armed forces. She has said the following on military intervention on the African continent: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “The French army is not there to protect regimes anymore, but to support local armies in their fight against terrorism.” (Le Monde Afrique, April 11th, 2017) “[French] support in Africa will be conditioned to good governance and to respect for the rule of law.” (Le Monde Afrique, April 11th, 2017)

Fight against impunity		
	Emmanuel Macron	Marine Le Pen
<p>Human Rights Watch position</p> <p>France should fight impunity for genocide, war crimes, and crimes against humanity by ensuring strong political and financial support for the International Criminal Court.</p> <p>The president should support ongoing efforts by French judicial authorities to investigate and prosecute serious crimes committed abroad, in places such as Syria.</p> <p>(more information here)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ “France has always supported the ICC [...] The French contribution [to the ICC budget] has increased in the past few years [...]. We will continue this effort.” (Letter) ▪ ” The fight against impunity must be seen in a more global way: new forms of transitional justice are currently being explored and deserve to be supported.” (Letter) ▪ “It is also necessary to explore the fight against impunity at the non-judicial level. Some recommendations must be submitted to the Secretary General of the United Nations by the month of June.” (Letter) ▪ “We intend to support an active preventive diplomacy [...] in order to [...] anticipate and prevent the commission of such crimes.” (Letter) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ To the best of our knowledge, Marine Le Pen has not publicly expressed a position on this matter.