Human Rights Watch Briefing Paper

Cluster Munitions a Foreseeable Hazard in Iraq

Four U.S. Cluster Munitions of Concern
The Proliferation of Cluster Munitions of Concern
The Cluster Munition Problem from the 1991 Persian Gulf War
Impact on U.S. Military Forces
A Better Future?
Conclusion

March 2003
Cluster Munitions a Foreseeable Hazard in Iraq

The use of cluster munitions in Iraq will result in grave dangers to civilians and friendly combatants. Based on experiences in the Persian Gulf War in 1991, Yugoslavia/Kosovo in 1999, and Afghanistan in 2001 and 2002, these dangers are both foreseeable and preventable.

Cluster munitions cannot be targeted with precision. They cause damage over a very large and imprecise area, and, due to the numbers used and high failure rate, leave behind a great many unexploded “dud” submunitions that become de facto antipersonnel landmines. Human Rights Watch has called for a global moratorium on use of cluster munitions until these humanitarian problems are addressed. Environmental factors in parts of Iraq such as sand, wind, and marshes would likely contribute to producing even higher dud rates for submunitions.

This briefing paper identifies four types of U.S. cluster munitions in particular that have produced large numbers of hazardous duds during previous combat operations and during testing. These four cluster munitions are currently in the inventory of the United States, United Kingdom, and other nations. This paper also provides details about the use of cluster munitions in the 1991 Persian Gulf War, including the threat to U.S. forces from their own weapons, and the ongoing impact of the resulting explosive dud submunitions. Human Rights Watch has recently obtained startling information showing that eleven years after the end of the war, about 200 hazardous cluster munition duds are still found and destroyed each month in Kuwait.

Four U.S. Cluster Munitions of Concern

Four types of U.S. cluster munitions have a history of producing high numbers of hazardous submunition duds. High dud rates have been documented in testing for Multiple Launch Rocket System (MLRS) M77 submunitions and 155mm artillery projectiles with M42 and M46 Dual Purpose Improved Conventional Munition (DPICM) submunitions. Two types of air-dropped cluster munitions--older Rockeye (CBU99/CBU-100) bombs and newer Combined Effects Munitions (CBU-87)--have produced high numbers of hazardous duds in combat operations in Iraq, Kuwait, Yugoslavia, and Afghanistan.

The United States stockpiles over one billion submunitions in weapons currently in service. Nearly three-quarters of this stockpile of submunitions are contained in MLRS rockets and 155mm artillery projectiles. Given reported failure rates, a stockpile of that size creates the specter of well over 100 million explosive duds, each posing a danger to civilians similar to antipersonnel landmines.
The four cluster munitions of concern and their reported failure rates include:

- **MLRS with M26 warhead**: 16 percent dud rate for the M77 submunition. Some lots were reported to have dud rates as high as 23 percent, based on testing done to accept newly produced batches. Each M26 warhead contains 644 submunitions. Thus, the standard volley of twelve MLRS rockets would likely result in more than 1,200 dud submunitions scattered randomly in a 120,000 to 240,000 square meter impact area. The U.S. stockpile of MLRS rockets contains over 309 million submunitions. This could equate to more than 49.4 million explosive duds.

- **155mm DPICM M483A1 & M864 artillery projectiles**: 14 percent dud rate for the M42 and M46 DPICM submunitions. The M483A1 artillery projectile contains sixty-four M42 and twenty-four M46 DPICM submunitions. The M864 projectile contains forty-eight M42 and twenty-four M46 DPICM submunitions. Based on the dud rate established by testing existing stocks of these projectiles, each M483A1 round fired would result in twelve dud submunitions and each M864 round would result in ten dud submunitions. The U.S. stockpile of 155mm projectiles contains over 434 million submunitions. This could equate to more than 60.7 million hazardous duds.

- **Rockeye CBU-99/CBU-100**: Each Rockeye bomb contains 247 Mk 118 submunitions. These cluster bombs were used extensively in the 1991 Persian Gulf War. While no reliable estimate of the failure rate is available, clearance agencies in Kuwait encountered a very large number of dud Rockeye submunitions in their operations. One U.S. company reported clearing 95,799 M118 Rockeye submunitions in their sector of Kuwait, which constituted 18% of the total area cleared. In 2002, 451 Rockeye submunitions were detected and destroyed by mine clearance and explosive ordnance disposal teams in Kuwait. Rockeyes, which were developed in the 1950s, were also used in great numbers in the Vietnam War. The number of Rockeye bombs currently in the U.S. arsenal is unknown, but is still believed to be high.

---

- **Combined Effects Munition CBU-87**: dud rates of at least 5 to 7 percent for the BLU-97 submunition in operations in Yugoslavia/Kosovo and Afghanistan. The CBU-87 is an air-dropped bomb that contains 202 BLU-97 submunitions. Using the 7 percent submunition failure rate documented in Kosovo, each bomb dropped would result in fourteen explosive dud submunitions over an area about the size of a U.S. football field. The U.S. used a total of 10,035 CBU-87s, with more than 2 million submunitions, during the 1991 Persian Gulf War. The size of the U.S. stockpile of this older version of the Combined Effects Munition (CBU-87), which was first produced in 1984, is not known. But large numbers are believed to be held, even though newer models (CBU-103) are being fielded with improved accuracy, due to the Wind Corrected Munitions Dispenser, and fuze modifications.

In addition to these four cluster munitions, there are others with high failure rates that could be used in Iraq. While many of the older Vietnam-era cluster munitions that were used in large numbers in 1991 in Kuwait and Iraq are no longer serviceable and are prohibited from use, the U.S. military is retaining some older cluster munitions to make up for shortfalls in the inventories of newer, more reliable cluster munitions. For example, one older type of 105mm artillery projectile (designated M444) with a submunition dud rate of 12 percent is being retained to cover for stockpile shortages of another projectile (designated M915) with a 1 percent dud rate and a self-destruct fuze.

**The Proliferation of Cluster Munitions of Concern**

The U.S. Department of Defense has also disposed of some of its aging cluster munitions by sales to foreign militaries. The four cluster munitions identified above are already found in the inventory of many other countries, as detailed in the table below:

---


Cluster Munitions a Foreseeable Hazard in Iraq

The Cluster Munition Problem from the 1991 Persian Gulf War

Human Rights Watch has reported previously on the use of cluster bombs during the 1991 Persian Gulf War. Aerial-delivered cluster munitions accounted for about one-quarter of the bombs dropped on Iraq and Kuwait. Between January 17 and February 28, 1991, the United States and its allied coalition used a total of 61,000 air-dropped cluster munitions, releasing twenty million submunitions. About fifteen percent of those were CBU-87s, then new to the U.S. arsenal. Other, less reliable Vietnam-era cluster munitions were used in surprising large numbers, including CBU-52, CBU-58, CBU-71, and early versions of the Rockeye. The number of cluster munitions delivered by surface-launched artillery and rocket systems during the Gulf War is not known, but one source estimates that over thirty million DPICM submunitions were used in the conflict.

From the end of the conflict in 1991 through December 2002, 108 metric tons of cluster munitions were discovered and destroyed by mine clearance and explosive ordnance disposal teams in Kuwait. In the year 2002, more than a decade after the fighting stopped, 2,400 explosive dud cluster munitions were detected and destroyed. These included: M42/M46/M77 (DPICM), Mk-118 (Rockeye), BLU-61A/B, BLU-77B, BLU-91B (Gator antivehicle mine), BLU-92B (Gator antipersonnel mine), BLU-97 (CBU-87), and Belouga (a French air-dropped cluster munition). Almost one in five of the dud cluster munitions found in 2002 were from Rockeye air-dropped bombs.

This average of nearly seven per day is all the more stunning in that one of the most extensive and expensive clearance operations in history was carried out immediately after the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster Munition Type</th>
<th>Countries that Stockpile</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MLRS with M26 warhead</td>
<td>Bahrain, Denmark, France, Germany, Greece, Israel, Italy, Japan, Netherlands, Norway, Turkey, United Kingdom, United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>155mm DPICM projectiles (M483A1 &amp; M864)</td>
<td>Canada, Jordan, Netherlands, Pakistan, South Korea, Turkey, United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined Effects Munition (CBU-87)</td>
<td>Egypt, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Saudi Arabia, South Korea, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom, United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rockeye</td>
<td>Canada, Denmark, Egypt, France, Israel, Norway, Oman, Turkey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

12 Ibid.
15 Ibid. According to the same document, a similar number of cluster munitions were cleared in 2001.
war.\textsuperscript{16} Hazardous dud cluster munitions continue to be uncovered in Kuwait. In February 2003, soldiers with the U.S. 3\textsuperscript{rd} Infantry Division discovered a dud BLU-63 cluster munition on one of their urban combat training ranges in the Kuwaiti desert.\textsuperscript{17}

While less information is available on the problem in Iraq, Iraq is still severely affected by landmines, cluster munition duds, and other types of unexploded ordnance (UXO) from the 1991 Gulf War, as well as the 1980-1988 Iraq-Iran War, two decades of internal conflict, and World War Two. Landmines and UXO pose a problem in the north, along the Iran-Iraq border, and throughout the central and southern regions of the country.\textsuperscript{18} The International Committee of the Red Cross in 2001 identified unexploded cluster bombs and other UXO as the main threat to communities living in southern Iraq.\textsuperscript{19}

**Impact on U.S. Military Forces**

During combat in the 1991 Persian Gulf War, U.S. forces experienced the danger of casualties caused by their own weapons as well as impediments to mobility when operating in areas contaminated by hazardous duds produced by U.S. cluster munitions.\textsuperscript{20} Numerous references to this are found in official U.S. military documents. One report states, “Battlefield experience has demonstrated that weapon systems containing submunitions present the greatest potential for creating UXO, since a significant percentage of these submunitions may not detonate reliably.”\textsuperscript{21} The U.S. Armed Services recorded 177 “explosion casualties” in the conflict, constituting 13 percent of the total U.S. military casualties.\textsuperscript{22} At least eighty of the U.S. casualties were attributed to cluster munition duds.

### U.S. Military “Explosion Casualties” During 1991 Gulf War

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Munition</th>
<th>Number of Casualties</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cluster Munition UXO-CBU</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unidentified Landmine</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraqi Landmines</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster Munition UXO-DPICM</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other UXO</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{16} See, for example, ICBL, *Landmine Monitor Report 1999*, p. 891.

\textsuperscript{17} Juan Tamayo, “10 Million Land Mines Lie in Wait Inside Iraq, Troops also face '91 War Leftovers,” *Miami Herald*, February 20, 2003.


\textsuperscript{22} U.S. General Accounting Office, “GAO-02-1003,” p. 15, p. 17, figure 2. All casualty figures provided to GAO by U.S. Armed Services and are treated separately from casualties resulting from direct enemy action.
A Better Future?

The United States military has recognized that the high failure rate of its existing stockpile of cluster munitions poses unacceptable risks to both U.S. forces and civilian populations. Efforts are underway to improve the reliability of newly produced cluster munitions. As a result of a new policy decision in 2001, weapons with submunitions produced after 2005 are required to be 99 percent reliable.\textsuperscript{23} A contract was awarded in February 2003 to manufacture 500,000 self-destruct fuzes for M915 105mm DPICM artillery projectiles.\textsuperscript{24} Funds to remanufacture and retrofit 24,345 M864 155mm DPICM projectiles with self-destruct fuzes were requested in the fiscal year 2004-2005 ammunition procurement budget request.\textsuperscript{25} Plans to produce a new generation of MLRS rockets with self-destruct fuzes for submunitions are also being developed.\textsuperscript{26}

However, the 2001 policy permits continued use of existing cluster munitions that do not meet the new standard: “The services may retain ‘legacy’ submunitions until employed or superceded by replacement systems…” The U.S. stockpiles more than one billion of these “legacy” submunitions with a failure rate of more than 1 percent. There is a fundamental inconsistency in acknowledging the dangers of these submunitions and the need to replace them, while still permitting their use.

Conclusion

As noted above, Human Rights Watch has called for a global moratorium on use of cluster munitions until the humanitarian problems are addressed. Short of that commitment, Human Rights Watch urges that the United States, United Kingdom, and others that may deploy cluster munitions in Iraq take the following steps:

- Prohibit the use of any cluster munitions in attacks on or near populated areas;
- Suspend use of and withdraw cluster munitions that have been tested and identified as producing high dud rates;
- Refrain from using or transferring out-of-date types of cluster munitions in an effort to “clean the closet” of stockpiles;
- Record, report, track, and mark known or suspected cluster munition strike areas; and,
- Preserve this information so it can be disseminated quickly in clearance efforts.

\textsuperscript{23} Secretary of Defense William Cohen, “Memorandum for the Secretaries of the Military Departments, Subject: Department of Defense Policy on Submunition Reliability (U),” January 10, 2001. It states, “It is the policy of the DoD [Department of Defense] to reduce overall UXO through a process of improvement in submunition system reliability – the desire is to field future submunitions with a 99% or higher functioning rate…. The Services shall evaluate ‘legacy’ submunition weapons undergoing reprocurement, product improvement, or block upgrades to determine whether modifications should be made to bring them into compliance with the above policy.”

