

**APPENDIX B: LETTERS TO CORPORATIONS**

# HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

1630 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20009  
Telephone: 202-612-4321  
Facsimile: 202-612-4333  
E-mail: hrwd  
Website: <http://www.hrw.org>



## AMERICAS DIVISION

José Miguel Vivanco  
*Executive Director*  
Jovanne Mariner  
*Deputy Director*  
Joel Solomon  
*Research Director*  
Carol Pier  
*Researcher*  
Sebastian Brett  
Robin Kirk  
*Research Associates*  
Tzeitel Cruz  
Elizabeth Hollenback  
*Associates*

## ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Stephen L. Kass, *Chair*  
Marina Pinto Kaufman  
David Nachman  
*Vice Chairs*  
Roland Algrant  
Peter D. Bell  
Marcelo Bronstein  
Paul Chevigny  
Roberto Cuellar  
Dorothy Cullinan  
Tom J. Farer  
Alejandro Garro  
Peter Hakim  
Ronald G. Hellman  
Bianca Jagger  
Mark Kaplan  
Margaret A. Lang  
Kenneth Maxwell  
Jocelyn McCalla  
Bruce Rabb  
Michael Shifter  
George Soros  
Julien Studley  
Rose Styron  
Javier Timmerman  
Horacio Verbitsky  
José Zalaquett

## HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

Kenneth Roth  
*Executive Director*  
Michele Alexander  
*Development Director*  
Carroll Bogert  
*Communications Director*  
Reed Brody  
*Advocacy Director*  
Barbara Guglielmo  
*Finance Director*  
Lotte Leicht  
*Brussels Office Director*  
Michael McClintock  
*Deputy Program Director*  
Maria Pignataro Nielsen  
*Human Resources Director*  
Dinah PoKempner  
*General Counsel*  
Malcolm Smart  
*Program Director*  
Wilder Taylor  
*Legal and Policy Director*  
Joanna Weschler  
*UN Representative*  
Jonathan Fanton  
*Chair*

Carl Linder  
Chief Executive Officer  
Chiquita Brands International, Inc.  
250 East Fifth Street  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Via Fax: 513-579-2580

July 13, 2001

Dear Mr. Linder:

Human Rights Watch is preparing a report on child labor and freedom of association in the banana sector in Ecuador. Human Rights Watch is an independent, nongovernmental organization that since 1978 has conducted investigations of human rights abuses throughout the world.

Attached are questions regarding Chiquita's contractual relationships with specific Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations and Chiquita's general labor policies with respect to its Ecuadorean banana suppliers. We would appreciate your answers to these questions, which would be reflected in our report. In light of our publishing schedule, we would be grateful to receive your response within one month's time.

I also wish to request at your earliest convenience an interview with you or a Chiquita employee who is knowledgeable about labor practices on the plantations of Chiquita's suppliers in Ecuador.

Thank you very much. I look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Carol Pier".

Carol Pier  
Labor Rights Researcher  
Americas Division  
Human Rights Watch

To: Chiquita Brands International, Inc.  
From: Human Rights Watch  
Date: July 13, 2001  
Subject: Banana plantations in Ecuador producing for Chiquita

A. Chiquita Contractual Relationships

Human Rights Watch was informed that although Chiquita has not had long-standing contractual relationships, during the years indicated, with the plantations and producers listed below, Chiquita nonetheless has purchased bananas for export from them sporadically during these periods. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information.

Cañas, owned by Vicente Ordoñez in the El Oro Province in the canton of Machala, from 1999 through 2001, and the following banana producers and plantations in Guayas Province: Balao Chico in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Las Fincas, comprised of San Fernando, San Alejandro, San Gabriel, and San José, in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Italia in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Colón in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Recreo in the canton of Naranjal from 2000 through 2001; San Carlos in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; Santa Carla in the canton of Balao from 1997 through 2001; Flor María of Sociedad Predio Rústico Agrícola Italia in the canton of Balao from 1997 through 2001; Guabital in the canton of Balao from 1998 through 2001; Alamos-Rey Rancho in the canton of Naranjal from 1995 through 2001; Predio Rústico La Rural, C.A., in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001.

We would also welcome the names and locations of the producers and plantations in Ecuador that are among Chiquita's principal suppliers and with which Chiquita has had contractual relationships between 1995 and May 2001.

B. Chiquita Labor Practices

We would appreciate information about the policies Chiquita has adopted regarding respect for labor rights on the plantations from which it purchases bananas for export—both those with which it has standing contractual relationships and those from which it purchases bananas on an irregular basis.

Specifically, we would welcome your responses to the following questions:

1. Does Chiquita impose any age restrictions on workers employed on these plantations? Are there age restrictions for the performance of

- certain types of tasks or for working under certain conditions? What steps does Chiquita take to ensure compliance with those restrictions?
2. Does Chiquita have a policy with respect to the use of temporary workers and subcontractors and the duration of their contracts on these plantations?
  3. What steps does Chiquita take to ensure that the right to freedom of association, including the right to unionize, is respected on these plantations?
  4. Does Chiquita monitor, on an ongoing basis, labor rights conditions on the Ecuadorean plantations from which it purchases bananas for export? Has Chiquita conducted any labor rights monitoring or inspections of the above-listed Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations?

## HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

1630 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20009  
Telephone: 202-612-4321  
Facsimile: 202-612-4333  
E-mail: hrwd  
Website: <http://www.hrw.org>



### AMERICAS DIVISION

José Miguel Vivanco  
*Executive Director*  
Joanne Mariner  
*Deputy Director*  
Joel Solomon  
*Research Director*  
Carol Pier  
*Researcher*  
Sebastian Brett  
Robin Kirk  
*Research Associates*  
Tzeitel Cruz  
Elizabeth Hollenback  
*Associates*

### ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Stephen L. Kass, *Chair*  
Marina Pinto Kaufman  
David Nachman  
*Vice Chairs*  
Roland Agrant  
Peter D. Bell  
Marcelo Bronstein  
Paul Chevigny  
Roberto Cuellar  
Dorothy Cullman  
Tom J. Farer  
Alejandro Garro  
Peter Hakim  
Ronald G. Hellman  
Bianca Jagger  
Mark Kaplan  
Margaret A. Lang  
Kenneth Maxwell  
Jocelyn McCalla  
Bruce Rabb  
Michael Shifter  
George Soros  
Julien Studley  
Rose Styron  
Javier Timenman  
Horacio Verbitsky  
José Zalaquett

### HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

Kenneth Roth  
*Executive Director*  
Michele Alexander  
*Development Director*  
Carroll Bogert  
*Communications Director*  
Reed Brody  
*Advocacy Director*  
Barbara Guglielmo  
*Finance Director*  
Lotte Leicht  
*Brussels Office Director*  
Michael McClintock  
*Deputy Program Director*  
Maria Pignataro Nielsen  
*Human Resources Director*  
Dinah PoKempner  
*General Counsel*  
Malcolm Smart  
*Program Director*  
Wilder Taylor  
*Legal and Policy Director*  
Joanna Weschler  
*UN Representative*  
Jonathan Fanton  
*Chair*

Mohammad Abu-Ghazaleh  
Chief Executive Officer  
Del Monte Fresh Produce Company  
800 Douglas Road  
North Tower, 12th Floor  
Coral Gables, FL 33134  
*Via Fax: 305-520-8495*

July 18, 2001

Dear Mr. Abu-Ghazaleh:

Human Rights Watch is preparing a report on child labor and freedom of association in the banana sector in Ecuador. Human Rights Watch is an independent, nongovernmental organization that since 1978 has conducted investigations of human rights abuses throughout the world.

Attached are questions regarding Del Monte's contractual relationships with specific Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations and Del Monte's general labor policies with respect to its Ecuadorean banana suppliers. We would appreciate your answers to these questions, which would be reflected in our report. In light of our publishing schedule, we would be grateful to receive your response within one month's time.

I also wish to request at your earliest convenience an interview with you or a Del Monte employee who is knowledgeable about labor practices on the plantations of Del Monte's suppliers in Ecuador.

Thank you very much. I look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Carol Pier".

Carol Pier  
Labor Rights Researcher  
Americas Division  
Human Rights Watch

To: Del Monte Fresh Produce Company  
From: Human Rights Watch  
Date: July 18, 2001  
Subject: Banana plantations in Ecuador producing for Del Monte

A. Del Monte Contractual Relationships

Human Rights Watch was informed that the plantations and producers listed below are among Del Monte's principal Ecuadorean banana suppliers and were producing primarily for Del Monte during the years stated or that Del Monte purchased significant quantities of bananas from them on a regular basis during these periods. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information and state when your contractual relationship with each producer and plantation began and whether the relationship still existed as of May 2001 or, if no standing contractual relationship existed, when you began to purchase significant quantities of bananas from these producers and plantations and whether you continue to do so.

Plantations and producers in Guayas Province: Santa Carla in the canton of Balao from 1997 through 2001; Fátima in the canton of Naranjal from 1995 through 2001; Guabital in the canton of Balao from 1998 through 2001; and San Miguel in the canton of Naranjal from 2000 through 2001.

Human Rights Watch was also informed that although Del Monte has not had long-standing contractual relationships, during the years indicated, with the plantations and producers listed below, Del Monte nonetheless has purchased bananas for export from them sporadically during these periods. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information as well.

Cañas, owned by Vicente Ordoñez, from 1999 through 2001, and Cañas, owned by Victor Moreno, in 1997, both in the province of El Oro in the canton of Machala, and the following group of banana producers and plantations in the Guayas Province: Recreo in the canton of Naranjal from 2000 through 2001; Pachina in the canton of Balao in 2001; Balao Chico in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Las Fincas, comprised of San Fernando, San Alejandro, San Gabriel, and San José, in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; San José of Parazul, S.A., in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; Italia in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Colón in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; San Carlos in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; Alamos-Rey Rancho in the canton of Naranjal from 1995 through 2001; and Flor María of Sociedad Predio Rústico Agrícola Italia in the canton of Balao from 1997 through 2001.

We would also welcome the names and locations of the other producers and plantations in Ecuador that are among Del Monte's principal suppliers and with which Del Monte has had contractual relationships between 1995 and May 2001.

**B. Del Monte Labor Practices**

We would appreciate information about the policies Del Monte has adopted regarding respect for labor rights on the plantations from which it purchases bananas for export—both those with which it has standing contractual relationships and those from which it purchases bananas on an irregular basis.

Specifically, we would welcome your responses to the following questions:

- 1 Does Del Monte impose any age restrictions on workers employed on these plantations? Are there age restrictions for the performance of certain types of tasks or for working under certain conditions? What steps does Del Monte take to ensure compliance with those restrictions?  
Does Del Monte have a policy with respect to the use of temporary workers and subcontractors and the duration of their contracts on these plantations?
- 3 What steps does Del Monte take to ensure that the right to freedom of association, including the right to unionize, is respected on these plantations?
4. Does Del Monte monitor, on an ongoing basis, labor rights conditions on the Ecuadorean plantations from which it purchases bananas for export? Has Del Monte conducted any labor rights monitoring or inspections of the above-listed Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations?

# HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

1630 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20009  
Telephone: 202-612-4321  
Facsimile: 202-612-4333  
E-mail: hrwd  
Website: <http://www.hrw.org>



## AMERICAS DIVISION

José Miguel Vivanco  
*Executive Director*  
Joanne Mariner  
*Deputy Director*  
Joel Solomon  
*Research Director*  
Carol Pier  
*Researcher*  
Sebastian Brett  
Robin Kirk  
*Research Associates*  
Tzeitel Cruz  
Elizabeth Hollenback  
*Associates*

## ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Stephen L. Kass, *Chair*  
Marina Pinto Kaufman  
David Naclman  
*Vice Chairs*  
Roland Algrant  
Peter D. Bell  
Marcelo Bronstein  
Paul Chevigny  
Roberto Cuellar  
Dorothy Cullman  
Tom J. Farer  
Alejandro Garro  
Peter Hakim  
Ronald G. Hellman  
Bianca Jagger  
Mark Kaplan  
Margaret A. Lang  
Kenneth Maxwell  
Jocelyn McCalla  
Bruce Rabb  
Michael Sliffler  
George Soros  
Julien Studley  
Rose Styron  
Javier Ternerman  
Horacio Verbitsky  
José Zalaquett

## HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

Kenneth Roth  
*Executive Director*  
Michele Alexander  
*Development Director*  
Carroll Bogert  
*Communications Director*  
Reed Brody  
*Advocacy Director*  
Barbara Guglielmo  
*Finance Director*  
Lotte Leicht  
*Brussels Office Director*  
Michael McClintock  
*Deputy Program Director*  
Maria Pignataro Nielsen  
*Human Resources Director*  
Dinah PoKempner  
*General Counsel*  
Malcolm Smart  
*Program Director*  
Wikler Taylor  
*Legal and Policy Director*  
Joanna Weschler  
*UN Representative*  
Jonathan Fauton  
*Chair*

David H. Murdock  
Chief Executive Officer  
Dole Food Company, Inc.  
One Dole Drive  
Westlake Village, CA 91362-7300  
Via Fax: 818-874-4893

July 13, 2001

Dear Mr. Murdock:

Human Rights Watch is preparing a report on child labor and freedom of association in the banana sector in Ecuador. Human Rights Watch is an independent, nongovernmental organization that since 1978 has conducted investigations of human rights abuses throughout the world.

Attached are questions regarding Dole's contractual relationships with specific Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations and Dole's general labor policies with respect to its Ecuadorean banana suppliers. We would appreciate your answers to these questions, which would be reflected in our report. In light of our publishing schedule, we would be grateful to receive your response within one month's time.

I also wish to request at your earliest convenience an interview with you or a Dole employee who is knowledgeable about labor practices on the plantations of Dole's suppliers in Ecuador.

Thank you very much. I look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Carol Pier".

Carol Pier  
Labor Rights Researcher  
Americas Division  
Human Rights Watch

To: Dole Food Company, Inc.  
From: Human Rights Watch  
Date: July 13, 2001  
Subject: Banana plantations in Ecuador producing for Dole

A. Dole Contractual Relationships

Human Rights Watch was informed that the plantations and producers listed below are among Dole's approximately 300 principal Ecuadorean banana suppliers and were producing primarily for Dole during the years stated. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information and state when your contractual relationship with each producer and plantation began and whether the relationship still existed as of May 2001.

Plantations and producers in Guayas Province: Recreo in the canton of Naranjal from 2000 through 2001; Pachina in the canton of Balao in 2001; Pitufina, S.A., in the canton of Balao from 1998 through 2001; Porvenir in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Luz Belén in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Balao Chico in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; La María of Frutos Bellos, C.A., in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Las Fincas, comprised of San Fernando, San Alejandro, San Gabriel, and San José, in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; San José of Krapp, S.A., in the canton of Balao in 1999; San José of Parazul, S.A., in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; Italia in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; "Chanique" in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; San Vicente in the canton of Balao in 1999; Predio Rústico La Rural, C.A., in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; and El Gran Chaparral in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2000.

Human Rights Watch was also informed that although Dole has not had long-standing contractual relationships, during the years indicated, with the plantations and producers listed below, Dole nonetheless has purchased bananas for export from them sporadically during these periods. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information as well.

Cañas, owned by Vicente Ordoñez in the El Oro Province in the canton of Machala, from 1999 through 2001, and the following banana producers and plantations in Guayas Province: Colón in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Paladines in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; San Francisco in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; San Carlos in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; Flor María of Sociedad Predio Rústico Agrícola Italia in the canton of Balao from 1997 through 2001; and Alamos-Rey Rancho in the canton of Naranjal from 1995 through 2001.

We would also welcome the names and locations of the other producers and plantations in Ecuador that are among Dole's approximately 300 principal suppliers and with which Dole has had contractual relationships between 1995 and May 2001.

**B. Dole Labor Practices**

We would appreciate information about the policies Dole has adopted regarding respect for labor rights on the plantations from which it purchases bananas for export—both those with which it has standing contractual relationships and those from which it purchases bananas on an irregular basis.

Specifically, we would welcome your responses to the following questions:

- Does Dole impose any age restrictions on workers employed on these plantations? Are there age restrictions for the performance of certain types of tasks or for working under certain conditions? What steps does Dole take to ensure compliance with those restrictions?
2. Does Dole have a policy with respect to the use of temporary workers and subcontractors and the duration of their contracts on these plantations?
3. What steps does Dole take to ensure that the right to freedom of association, including the right to unionize, is respected on these plantations?
4. Does Dole monitor, on an ongoing basis, labor rights conditions on the Ecuadorean plantations from which it purchases bananas for export? Has Dole conducted any labor rights monitoring or inspections of the above-listed Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations?

# HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

1630 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20009  
Telephone: 202-612-4321  
Facsimile: 202-612-4333  
E-mail: hrwd  
Website: <http://www.hrw.org>



## AMERICAS DIVISION

José Miguel Vivanco  
*Executive Director*  
Joanne Mariner  
*Deputy Director*  
Joel Solomon  
*Research Director*  
Carol Pier  
*Researcher*  
Sebastian Brett  
Robin Kirk  
*Research Associates*  
Tzeitel Cruz  
Elizabeth Hollenback  
*Associates*

## ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Stephen L. Kass, *Chair*  
Marina Pinto Kaufman  
David Nachman  
*Vice Chairs*  
Roland Algrant  
Peter D. Bell  
Marcelo Bronstein  
Paul Chevigny  
Roberto Cuellar  
Dorothy Cullinan  
Tom J. Farer  
Alejandro Garro  
Peter Hakim  
Ronald G. Hellman  
Bianca Jagger  
Mark Kaplan  
Margaret A. Lang  
Kenneth Maxwell  
Jocelyn McCalla  
Bruce Rabb  
Michael Shifter  
George Soros  
Julien Studley  
Rose Styron  
Javier Timmerman  
Horacio Verbitsky  
José Zalaquett

## HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

Kenneth Roth  
*Executive Director*  
Michele Alexander  
*Development Director*  
Carroll Bogert  
*Communications Director*  
Reed Brody  
*Advocacy Director*  
Barbara Guglielmo  
*Finance Director*  
Lotte Leicht  
*Brussels Office Director*  
Michael McClintock  
*Deputy Program Director*  
Maria Pignataro Nielsen  
*Human Resources Director*  
Dinah PoKempner  
*General Counsel*  
Malcolm Smart  
*Program Director*  
Wilder Taylor  
*Legal and Policy Director*  
Joanna Weschler  
*UN Representative*  
Jonathan Fanton  
*Chair*

Dr. Segundo Wong Mayorga  
Executive President

Favorita Fruit Company

Avenida Carlos Julio Arosemena Km. 1 ½ Mz. 001 solar 41(2)

frente al Centro Comercial Albán Borja

Guayaquil, Ecuador

Via Fax: 011-593-4208-660 or 011-593-4208-661

July 13, 2001

Dear Dr. Wong:

Human Rights Watch is preparing a report on child labor and freedom of association in the banana sector in Ecuador. Human Rights Watch is an independent, nongovernmental organization that since 1978 has conducted investigations of human rights abuses throughout the world.

Attached are questions regarding Favorita's contractual relationships with specific Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations and Favorita's general labor policies with respect to its Ecuadorean banana suppliers. We would appreciate your answers to these questions, which would be reflected in our report. In light of our publishing schedule, we would be grateful to receive your response within one month's time.

I also wish to request at your earliest convenience an interview with you or a Favorita employee who is knowledgeable about labor practices on the plantations of Favorita's suppliers in Ecuador.

Thank you very much. I look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Carol Pier".

Carol Pier  
Labor Rights Researcher  
Americas Division  
Human Rights Watch

To: Favorita Fruit Company  
From: Human Rights Watch  
Date: July 13, 2001  
Subject: Banana plantations in Ecuador producing for Favorita

A. Favorita Contractual Relationships

Human Rights Watch was informed that La Juanita in the canton of Balao in the province of Guayas, from 1995 through 2001, was among Favorita's principal Ecuadorean banana suppliers and was producing primarily for Favorita during the years stated or that Favorita purchased significant quantities of bananas from La Juanita on a regular basis during that period. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information and state when your contractual relationship with La Juanita began and whether the relationship still existed as of May 2001 or, if no standing contractual relationship existed, when you began to purchase significant quantities of bananas from La Juanita and whether you continue to do so.

Human Rights Watch was also informed that although Favorita has not had long-standing contractual relationships, during the years indicated, with the plantations and producers listed below, Favorita nonetheless has purchased bananas for export from them sporadically during these periods. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information as well.

Plantations and producers in Guayas Province: Balao Chico in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; and Italia in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001.

We would also welcome the names and locations of the other producers and plantations in Ecuador that are among Favorita's principal suppliers and with which Favorita has had contractual relationships between 1995 and May 2001

B. Favorita Labor Practices

We would appreciate information about the policies Favorita has adopted regarding respect for labor rights on the plantations from which it purchases bananas for export—both those with which it has standing contractual relationships and those from which it purchases bananas on an irregular basis.

Specifically, we would welcome your responses to the following questions:

- 1 Does Favorita impose any age restrictions on workers employed on these plantations? Are there age restrictions for the performance of certain types of tasks or for working under certain conditions? What steps does Favorita take to ensure compliance with those restrictions?

2. Does Favorita have a policy with respect to the use of temporary workers and subcontractors and the duration of their contracts on these plantations?
3. What steps does Favorita take to ensure that the right to freedom of association, including the right to unionize, is respected on these plantations?
4. Does Favorita monitor, on an ongoing basis, labor rights conditions on the Ecuadorean plantations from which it purchases bananas for export? Has Favorita conducted any labor rights monitoring or inspections of the above-listed Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations?

# HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

1630 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20009  
Telephone: 202-612-4321  
Facsimile: 202-612-4333  
E-mail: hrwd  
Website: <http://www.hrw.org>

## AMERICAS DIVISION

José Miguel Vivanco  
*Executive Director*  
Joanne Mariner  
*Deputy Director*  
Joel Solomon  
*Research Director*  
Carol Pier  
*Researcher*  
Sebastian Brett  
Robin Kirk  
*Research Associates*  
Tzeitel Cruz  
Elizabeth Hollenback  
*Associates*

## ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Stephen L. Kass, *Chair*  
Marina Pinto Kaufman  
David Nachman  
*Vice Chairs*  
Roland Algrant  
Peter D. Bell  
Marcelo Bronstein  
Paul Chevigny  
Roberto Cuellar  
Dorothy Cullinan  
Tom J. Farer  
Alejandro Garro  
Peter Hakim  
Ronald G. Hellman  
Bianca Jagger  
Mark Kaplan  
Margaret A. Lang  
Kenneth Maxwell  
Jocelyn McCalla  
Bruce Rabb  
Michael Shifter  
George Soros  
Julien Studley  
Rose Styron  
Javier Timmerman  
Horacio Verbitsky  
José Zalaquett

## HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

Kenneth Roth  
*Executive Director*  
Michele Alexander  
*Development Director*  
Carroll Bogert  
*Communications Director*  
Reed Brody  
*Advocacy Director*  
Barbara Guglielmo  
*Finance Director*  
Lotte Leicht  
*Brussels Office Director*  
Michael McClintock  
*Deputy Program Director*  
Maria Pignataro Nielsen  
*Human Resources Director*  
Dinah PoKempner  
*General Counsel*  
Malcolm Smart  
*Program Director*  
Wilker Taylor  
*Legal and Policy Director*  
Joanna Weschler  
*UN Representative*  
Jonathan Fanton  
*Chair*

**HUMAN  
RIGHTS  
WATCH**

Alvaro Noboa  
Chief Executive Officer  
Exportadora Bananera Noboa, S.A.  
El Oro 1010 y La Ría  
Guayaquil, Ecuador  
Via Fax: 593-42-445138

September 5, 2001

Dear Mr. Noboa:

Human Rights Watch is preparing a report on child labor and freedom of association in the banana sector in Ecuador. Human Rights Watch is an independent, nongovernmental organization that since 1978 has conducted investigations of human rights abuses throughout the world.

On July 13, 2001, I faxed and mailed the attached questions to Mr. Carlos Aguirre, head of your foreign office in Staten Island, New York. To date, he has not responded to the inquiries. When I contacted his office by telephone last week, I was instructed that the letter, instead, should be directed to you.

Attached are questions regarding Noboa's contractual relationships with specific Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations and Noboa's general labor policies with respect to its Ecuadorean banana suppliers. We would appreciate your answers to these questions, which would be reflected in our report. In light of our publishing schedule, we would be grateful to receive your response as soon as possible.

I also wish to request at your earliest convenience an interview with you or a Noboa employee who is knowledgeable about labor practices on the plantations of Noboa's suppliers in Ecuador.

Thank you very much. I look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely,



Carol Pier  
Labor Rights Researcher  
Americas Division  
Human Rights Watch

To: Exportadora Bananera Noboa, S.A.  
From: Human Rights Watch  
Date: July 13, 2001  
Subject: Banana plantations in Ecuador producing for Noboa

A. Noboa Contractual Relationships

Human Rights Watch was informed that the plantations and producers listed below are among Noboa's principal Ecuadorean banana suppliers and were producing primarily for Noboa during the years stated and that Noboa directly owned Alamos-Rey Rancho during the period listed. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information and state when your contractual relationship with each producer and plantation began and whether the relationship still existed as of May 2001 and when Noboa obtained ownership of Alamos-Rey Rancho and whether Noboa continued to own the plantation as of May 2001.

Plantations and producers in Guayas Province: Paladines in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; San Carlos in the canton of Balao from 1999 through 2001; San Francisco in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Recreo #1 and Recreo #3 in the canton of Naranjal from 1999 through 2001; Flor María of Sociedad Predio Rústico Agrícola Italia in the canton of Balao from 1997 through 2001; Colón in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; and Alamos-Rey Rancho in the canton of Naranjal from 1995 through 2001.

Human Rights Watch was also informed that although Noboa has not had long-standing contractual relationships, during the years indicated, with the plantations and producers listed below, Noboa nonetheless has purchased bananas for export from them sporadically during these periods. We would be grateful if you would confirm this information as well.

Cañas, owned by Vicente Ordoñez in the El Oro Province in the canton of Machala, from 1999 through 2001, and the following banana producers and plantations in Guayas Province: Pachina in the canton of Balao in 2001; Santa Carla in the canton of Balao from 1997 through 2001; Guabital in the canton of Balao from 1998 through 2001; San Miguel in the canton of Naranjal from 2000 through 2001; Luz Belén in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; Balao Chico in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; La María of Frutos Bellos, C.A., in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001; and Italia in the canton of Balao from 1995 through 2001.

We would also welcome the names and locations of the other producers and plantations in Ecuador that are among Noboa's principal suppliers and with which Noboa has had contractual relationships between 1995 and May 2001

#### B. Noboa Labor Practices

We would appreciate information about the policies Noboa has adopted regarding respect for labor rights on the plantations from which it purchases bananas for export—both those with which it has standing contractual relationships and those from which it purchases bananas on an irregular basis.

Specifically, we would welcome your responses to the following questions:

1. Does Noboa impose any age restrictions on workers employed on these plantations? Are there age restrictions for the performance of certain types of tasks or for working under certain conditions? What steps does Noboa take to ensure compliance with those restrictions?
2. Does Noboa have a policy with respect to the use of temporary workers and subcontractors and the duration of their contracts on these plantations?
3. What steps does Noboa take to ensure that the right to freedom of association, including the right to unionize, is respected on these plantations?
4. Does Noboa monitor, on an ongoing basis, labor rights conditions on the Ecuadorean plantations from which it purchases bananas for export? Has Noboa conducted any labor rights monitoring or inspections of the above-listed Ecuadorean banana producers and plantations?